

**IRA COMMITTEE  
MINUTES  
November 20, 2020**

**CALL TO ORDER**

Marcus Reveles, Committee Chair, called the meeting to order at 1:03 p.m.

**ROLL CALL**

**Student Members**

Present: Castro, Costello, Garcia, Herrera, Hussain, Thomas

Absent: Finley (E), Mendoza

**Faculty Members**

Present: Abnet, Bruschke, Mickey, Ngo, Nobari, Passante, Xie

Absent: None

**Non-Voting Members**

Present: Edwards, Masoud, Mollenauer, Ohtomo, Reveles, Stang,  
Ward

Absent:

Guests: Robbie Abraham

**(Thomas-m/Hussain-s)** A motion was made and seconded to excuse Finley due to class commitment by unanimous consent.

**APPROVAL OF AGENDA**

**(Mickey-m/Bruschke-s)** The agenda was approved as presented by unanimous consent.

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

**(Abnet-m/Castro-s)** The minutes from the November 13, 2020 meeting were approved as presented by unanimous consent.

**PUBLIC SPEAKERS**

There were no public speakers.

**REPORTS**

None.

**TIME CERTAIN**

None.

**UNFINISHED BUSINESS**

None.

**NEW BUSINESS**

**a. IRA Governance Document**

**IRA 012 20/21 (Bruschke-m/Castro-s)** A motion was made and seconded to approve the IRA Governance Document.

Reveles yielded to Edwards.

Edwards went over the document.

Stang stated that it sounds like only returning programs would be included based on the sentence "A complete proposal submission will include a current year application (signed by the faculty member, department chair and dean) and for returning programs, prior year's final report."

Passante made a friendly amendment to include “shall also include a” to the sentence that was reference by Stang. Costello seconded the friendly amendment. The new sentence would read, “A complete proposal submission will include a current year application (signed by the faculty member, department chair and dean) and for returning programs shall also include a prior year’s final report.”

Mickey asked if the final report needed to be included with the proposal.

Edwards stated that the final report needs to be submitted at the end of the program.

Stang suggested revising the sentence with “shall have previously submitted their”.

Nobari suggested separating the one sentence into two. The suggested language would be “A complete proposal submission will include a current year application (signed by the faculty member, department chair an dean). Returning programs shall also have previously submitted their prior year’s final report.”

There were no objections to the friendly amendment.

Reveles yielded to Edwards.

Passante asked what was meant by proposals being equitably considered. It seems that returning programs get priority in funding consideration.

Edwards stated that it should not be interpreted that returning programs get priority in funding.

Passante stated that it sounds equitable in the governance document, but the deliberation document makes it sound differently.

Abnet asked if Intersession should be included in the terms IRA programs could operate.

Edwards stated that Ohtomo had previously pointed out this omission. The term, now called Winter session, should have been added.

Abnet made a friendly amendment to add the Winter session to the document. Brusckke and Castro accepted the friendly amendment. There were no objections to the amendment. The document was amended.

Mickey asked if there was an update on equipment purchases, if they are cost friendly.

Edwards stated that the executive order does not allow equipment purchases.

There was no discussion.

**IRA 012 20/21 (Bruschke-m/Castro-s)** Roll Call Vote: 14-0-0. The motion was adopted.

**b. IRA Rubric and IRA Funding Deliberation Process**

**IRA 013 20/21 (Thomas-m/Bruschke-s)** A motion was made and seconded to approve the IRA rubric and funding deliberation process for the 2021-22 fiscal year.

Reveles yielded to Edwards.

Edwards stated that they would review the funding deliberation process first. The document includes different options for the Committee to consider. A simulation was run using the options and the applications from two years ago.

Edwards stated the Committee would approve this document annually.

**IRA 013A 20/21 (Bruschke-m/Nobari-s)** An amendment was made and seconded to add the language to the document [shown between quotation marks] that the committee should review and discuss any program that has a high standard deviation “or a change from one quartile to another” prior to making a funding decision. If necessary, an additional rater would be utilized.

Bruschke stated that last year’s governance document included using z-scores instead of the standard deviation.

Stang stated that in an ideal world, the members would rate all of the applications, and there would not be considerable inter-rater differences. That is not reasonable to think that the members could rate all proposals. The issue that Bruschke raises is certainly one concern of raters and reliability. By building in inter-rater experiences prior to anyone using the rubric, it is hoped that, in practice, it will improve the use of the rubric. Z-scores cannot be controlled, if the member received proposals that merited low rubric scores. The members need to trust each other when using the rubric to rate the proposals in the way that they have been trained to do so. There are many important decisions that the Committee needs to make.

The members discussed the amendment.

**IRA 013A 20/21 (Bruschke-m/Nobari-s)** Roll Call Vote: 14-0-0. The amendment was adopted.

Edwards stated that the motion was also need to approve the rubric.

Edwards stated that there was also rubric with suggested changes.

Edwards went over the rubrics.

Passante asked for clarification on one of the proposed changes to the rubric relies on the program having multiple sections and multiple instructors.

Bruschke stated that this was added on his perspective as a department chair.

Passante stated that this does not take into consideration smaller departments.

Ward stated that the 2016 IRA task force added language to the rubric to include mission and goals. The suggested changes to the rubric replace mission and goals with Overall Program Integration.

Bruschke suggested striking the multiple sections, multiple faculty from the rubric and replacing it with language about mission and goals.

The change was made.

**IRA 013B 20/21 (Bruschke-m/Mickey-s)** An amendment was made and seconded to accept the revised rubric.

There was no discussion.

**IRA 013B 20/21 (Bruschke-m/Mickey-s)** Roll Call Vote: 14-0-0. The amendment was adopted.

**IRA 013C 20/21 (Bruschke-m/Mickey-s)** An amendment was made and seconded to add option D to the funding deliberation process.

[Shand left the meeting at 2:30pm.]

Ward asked if there could be clarification about new programs not being allowed to request more than 70% of the prior year's average award.

Bruschke stated that with the past process, there was no limit on how much programs could request. In addition, there was no limit how much of an increase returning programs are allowed to request.

Passante stated that it did make sense to limit the increases from one year to the next, but not sure about limiting new programs requesting funds less than 70% of the average award.

Ward asked if there was a similar requirement limiting how much existing programs can request.

Bruschke stated that they could not request more than a 10% increase the next year.

Hussain stated that he did not see the benefit of restricting what new programs could request.

The members discussed how to change the percentage.

Thomas stated that the Provost and VP of Student Affairs did speak to the Committee that returning program should not be given priority when considering awards.

The members continued their discussion.

Reveles stated that the Committee could vote or postpone the item until the next meeting.

Edwards stated that there was another meeting in case any of the members would like to continue the discussion.

**IRA 013C 20/21 (Bruschke-m/Mickey-s)** Roll Call Vote: 12-0-1. The amendment was approved.

**IRA 013 20/21 (Thomas-m/Bruschke-s)** The amended motion was adopted.

**(Abnet-m/Thomas-s)** A motion was made, seconded and adopted by unanimous consent to postpone the decision on what option to choose for the IRA funding deliberation process until the next scheduled meeting on December 4, 2020.

**ROLL CALL VOTES**


|                | <b>012</b>    | <b>013A</b>   | <b>013B</b>   | <b>013C</b>   | <b>013</b>    |
|----------------|---------------|---------------|---------------|---------------|---------------|
| Castro         | Y             | Y             | Y             | Y             | Y             |
| Costello       | Y             | Y             | Y             | Y             | Y             |
| Finley         | Absent        |               |               |               |               |
| Garcia         | Y             | Y             | Y             | Y             | Y             |
| Herrera        | Y             | Y             | Y             | Y             | Y             |
| Hussain        | Y             | Y             | Y             | Y             | Y             |
| Mendoza        | Absent        |               |               |               |               |
| Thomas         | Y             | Y             | Y             | A             | A             |
| Abnet          | Y             | Y             | Y             | Y             | A             |
| Bruschke       | Y             | Y             | Y             | Y             | Y             |
| Mickey         | Y             | Y             | Y             | Y             | Y             |
| Ngo            | Y             | Y             | Y             | Y             | A             |
| Nobari         | Y             | Y             | Y             | Y             | Y             |
| Passante       | Y             | Y             | Y             | Y             | Y             |
| Shand          | Y             | Y             | Y             | Absent        |               |
| Xie            | Y             | Y             | Y             | Y             | Y             |
| <b>Results</b> | <b>14-0-0</b> | <b>14-0-0</b> | <b>14-0-0</b> | <b>12-0-1</b> | <b>10-0-3</b> |

**ANNOUNCEMENTS/MEMBERS' PRIVILEGE**

None.

**ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting was adjourned at 3:00 p.m.



Deserita Ohtomo, Recording Secretary



Marcus Reveles (Dec 8, 2020 16:56 PST)

Marcus Reveles, IRA Committee Chair